## Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings	Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings	Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(1) The purpose of this Directive is to establish procedural safeguards to ensure that children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings are able to understand and follow those proceedings, to enable such children to exercise their right to a fair trial and to prevent re-offending by children and foster their social integration.	(1) The purpose of this Directive is to establish procedural safeguards to ensure that children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings are able to understand and follow those proceedings, to enable such children to exercise their right to a fair trial and to prevent re-offending by children and foster their social integration.	(1) The purpose of this Directive is to establish procedural safeguards to ensure that children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings are able to understand and follow those proceedings, to enable such children to exercise their right to a fair trial and to prevent re-offending by children and foster their social integration.
(2) By establishing minimum rules on the protection of procedural rights of suspects or accused persons, this Directive should strengthen the trust of Member States in the criminal justice systems of other Member States and can thus help improve mutual recognition of decisions in criminal matters. Such common minimum rules should also remove obstacles to the free movement of citizens throughout the territory of the Member States.	(2) By establishing minimum rules on the protection of procedural rights of suspects or accused persons, this Directive should strengthen the trust of Member States in the criminal justice systems of other Member States and can thus help improve mutual recognition of decisions in criminal matters. Such common minimum rules should also remove obstacles to the free movement of citizens throughout the territory of the Member States.	(2) By establishing minimum rules on the protection of procedural rights of suspects or accused persons, this Directive should strengthen the trust of Member States in the criminal justice systems of other Member States and can thus help improve mutual recognition of decisions in criminal matters. Such common minimum rules should also remove obstacles to the free movement of citizens throughout the territory of the Member States.
(3) Although the Member States are	(3) Although the Member States	(3) Although the Charter of

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
parties to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, experience has shown that this in itself does not always provide a sufficient degree of trust in the criminal justice systems of other Member States.	are parties to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, experience has shown that this in itself does not always provide a sufficient degree of trust in the criminal justice systems of other Member States.	Fundamental Rights of the European Union (the Charter) applies, under certain conditions, to Member States and the Member States are parties to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, experience has shown that those facts alone do not always provide a sufficient degree of trust in the criminal justice systems of other Member States. (AM 1)
(4) The Stockholm Programme <sup>1</sup> put a strong focus on the strengthening of the rights of individuals in criminal proceedings. In its point 2.4, the European Council invited the Commission to put forward proposals setting out a step by step approach <sup>2</sup> to strengthening the rights of suspects or	(4) On 30 November 2009, the Council adopted a Resolution on a Roadmap for strengthening the procedural rights of suspected or accused persons in criminal proceedings ('the Roadmap'). <sup>3</sup> Taking a step-by-step approach, the Roadmap calls for the	(4) On 30 November 2009, the Council adopted the Roadmap for strengthening the procedural rights of suspected and accused persons in criminal proceedings ('the Roadmap'). Taking a step-by-step approach, the Roadmap calls for the adoption of measures

<sup>1</sup> 

<sup>2</sup> 

OJ C 115, 4.5.2010, p.1. OJ C 291, 4.12.2009, p.1. OJ C 295, 4.12.2009, p. 1. 3

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
accused persons.	adoption of measures regarding the right to translation and interpretation (measure A), the right to information on rights and information about the charges (measure B), the right to legal advice and legal aid (measure C), the right to communicate with relatives, employers and consular authorities (measure D), and special safeguards for suspects or accused persons who are vulnerable (measure E). The Roadmap emphasises that the order of the rights is only indicative and thus implies that it may be changed in accordance with priorities. The Roadmap is designed to operate as a whole; only when all its components are implemented will its benefits be felt in full.	regarding the right to translation and interpretation (measure A), the right to information on rights and information about the charges (measure B), the right to legal advice and legal aid (measure C), the right to communicate with relatives, employers and consular authorities (measure D), and special safeguards for suspects or accused persons who are vulnerable (measure E). The Roadmap emphasises that the order of the rights is indicative, implying that it may be changed according to priorities. It is designed to operate as a whole; only when all its components are implemented will its benefits be felt in full. (AM 2)
	(4a) On 11 December 2009, the European Council welcomed the Roadmap and made it part of the Stockholm programme — An open and secure Europe serving and protecting citizens (point	(4a) On 10 December 2009, the European Council welcomed the Roadmap and made it part of the Stockholm programme - An open and secure Europe serving and protecting citizens (point 2.4). The

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	2.4). <sup>4</sup> The European Council underlined the non-exhaustive character of the Roadmap, by inviting the Commission to examine further elements of minimum procedural rights for suspects and accused persons, and to assess whether other issues, for instance the presumption of innocence, need to be addressed, in order to promote better cooperation in that area.	European Council underlined the non-exhaustive character of the Roadmap, inviting the Commission to examine further elements of minimum procedural rights for suspected and accused persons, and to assess whether other issues, for instance the presumption of innocence, need to be addressed, in order to promote better cooperation in that area. (AM 3)
(5) Three measures have been adopted to date, namely Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council <sup>5</sup> , Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council <sup>6</sup> and	(5) Three measures have been adopted to date, namely Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council, Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the	(5) Three measures have been adopted to date, namely Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council, Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the

4 OJ C 115, 4.5.2010, p.1.

<sup>5</sup> Directive 2010/64/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 October 2010 on the right to interpretation and translation in

criminal proceedings (OJ L 280, 26.10.2010, p.1).

Directive 2012/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 May 2012 on the right to information in criminal proceedings (OJ L 142, 1.6.2012, p.1).

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council <sup>7</sup> .	Council and Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council.	Council and Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council.
(6) This Directive promotes the rights of the child, taking into account the Guidelines of the Council of Europe on child-friendly justice.	(6) This Directive promotes the rights of the child, taking into account the Guidelines of the Council of Europe on child-friendly justice.	(6) This Directive promotes the rights of the child, taking into account the Guidelines of the Council of Europe on child-friendly justice.
		(6a) Given the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union and the European Court of Human Rights, the criminal nature of proceedings cannot always be determined purely on the strength of their classification, and of the penalties which may be imposed, in national law. In order to achieve the aims of the Treaties and of this Directive and to ensure full respect for fundamental rights, including those set out in the Charter of Fundamental Rights and the ECHR, it is therefore appropriate,

Directive 2013/48/EU of the European Parliament and the Council of 22 October 2013 on the right of access to a lawyer in criminal proceedings and European arrest warrant proceedings and on the right to have a third party informed upon deprivation of liberty, and to communicate with third persons and with consular authorities (OJ L 294, 6.11.2013, p. 1).

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		for the purposes of this Directive, to take into account not only the formal classification of proceedings in national law, but also their effects on the lives and development of the children concerned. This Directive should be applied, in any event, where there is a possibility that proceedings will result in a criminal record. (AM 4)
		(6b) Member States should ensure that in all proceedings, children are treated with care, sensitivity and respect for their age, special needs, maturity and level of understanding and take into consideration any communication difficulties they may have.  Criminal proceedings involving children should be carried out in a non-intimidating and childsensitive way. (AM 5)
		(6c) The safeguards provided for in this Directive should therefore be applied, with such adjustments as might be necessary, to all

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		proceedings which might entail restrictive measures or, at any rate, significant consequences for children's lives and hence influence the development processes that shape their personalities, and in cases where, although no punishment is ordered, proceedings could lead to a decision giving to understand – if only implicitly – that the person concerned was responsible for the offence with which he or she had been charged. In all such cases, application of this Directive should not be ruled out by the fact that the proceedings did not result from actions termed criminal offences in national law, do not take place in a criminal court, or entail penalties formally classed as criminal in national law. (AM 6)
(7) Children who are suspects or accused in criminal cases should be given special attention in order to preserve their potential for development and reintegration into society.	(7) Children who are suspects or accused in criminal cases should be given special attention in order to preserve their potential for development and reintegration into society.	(7) Children who are suspects or accused in criminal cases should be given special attention in order to preserve their potential for development and reintegration into society.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		(7a) Member States are encouraged to provide children involved in criminal proceedings with appropriate support and assistance in their efforts to reintegrate in society, in particular by taking measures to prevent suspected or accused children from discrimination in access to education and labour market and to prevent them from marginalisation. (AM 7)
(8) This Directive should apply to children meaning persons under the age of 18 at the time when they become suspected or accused of having committed an offence, regardless of their age during the criminal proceedings until the final judgment.	(8) This Directive should apply to children meaning persons under the age of 18 from the time when they are made aware by the competent authorities of a Member State that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence. In respect of children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings, the relevant provisions of this Directive should apply from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State.	(8) This Directive should apply to children meaning persons under the age of 18 at the time when they become suspected or accused of having committed an offence, regardless of their age during the criminal proceedings until the final judgment.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(9) This Directive should also apply in respect of offences which have been committed after the age of 18 years by the same suspect or accused person and which are jointly investigated and prosecuted as they are inextricably linked to offences where criminal proceedings started against that person before the age of 18.	[deleted]	(9) This Directive should also apply in respect of offences which have been allegedly committed after the suspect or accused person had reached the age of 18 years, where such offences are jointly investigated and prosecuted as they are inextricably linked to offences to which this Directive applies. (AM 8)
(10) When, at the time a person becomes a suspect or accused person in criminal proceedings, that person is above the age of 18, Member States are encouraged to apply the procedural safeguards foreseen by this Directive until this person reaches the age of 21.	(10) When, at the time a person becomes a suspect or accused person in criminal proceedings, that person is above the age of 18, Member States are encouraged to apply the procedural safeguards foreseen by this Directive until this person reaches the age of 21, at least as regards offences that are committed by the same suspect or accused person and that are jointly investigated and prosecuted as they are inextricably linked to offences where criminal proceedings started against that person before the age of 18.	(10) When, at the time a person becomes a suspect or accused person in criminal proceedings, that person is above the age of 18, Member States should, especially if the offence was committed before the child in question had reached the age of 18, apply the procedural safeguards provided for in this Directive at least until this person reaches the age of 21. (AM 9)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(11) Member States should determine the age of children on the basis of the children's own statements, checks of their civil status, documentary research, other evidence and, if such evidence is unavailable or inconclusive, on the basis of a medical examination.	(11) Member States should determine the age of children on the basis of the children's own statements, checks of their civil status, documentary research, other evidence and, if such evidence is unavailable or inconclusive, on the basis of a medical examination.	(11) Member States should determine the age of children on the basis of the children's own statements, checks of their civil status, documentary research, other evidence and, if such evidence is unavailable or inconclusive, on the basis of a medical examination. A medical examination should be carried out as a last resort and in strict compliance with the child's rights, physical integrity and human dignity. Where a person's age is still in doubt, that person should, for all purposes, be presumed to be a child. (AM 10)
	(11a) The application of this Directive should be excluded in respect of some minor offences. However, such exclusion should not be made where the suspect or accused person is deprived of liberty; in such situation, the Directive shall in any case fully apply, in accordance with its provisions.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	authority other than a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters has competence for imposing sanctions other than deprivation of liberty in relation to relatively minor offences. That may be the case, for example, in relation to traffic offences which are committed on a large scale and which might be established following a traffic control. In such situations, it would be unreasonable to require that the competent authorities ensure all the rights under this Directive. Where the law of a Member State provides for the imposition of a sanction regarding minor offences by such an authority and there is either a right of appeal or the possibility for the case to be otherwise referred to a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, this Directive should therefore apply only to the proceedings before that court following such an appeal or referral.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	(11c) In some Member States certain minor offences, in particular minor traffic offences, minor offences in relation to general municipal regulations and minor public order offences, are considered to be criminal offences. In such situations, it would be unreasonable to require that the competent authorities ensure all the rights under this Directive. Where the law of a Member State provides in respect of minor offences that deprivation of liberty cannot be imposed as a sanction, this Directive should therefore apply only to the proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters.	
	(11d) In certain Member States children who have committed an act qualified as an offence are subject to proceedings which may not lead to the imposition of any criminal sanction, but which may lead to the imposition of restrictive measures, for instance protection measures, correction measures and education	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	measures, with a view to promoting the proper conduct of the children, bringing about favourable changes in the children's personality and behaviour, and helping them to integrate in society. Such proceedings do not fall within the scope of this Directive.	
implemented taking into account the provisions of Directive 2012/13/EU and Directive 2013/48/EU. Information with regard to minor offences should be provided under the same conditions as provided for by Article 2(2) of Directive 2012/13/EU. However, this Directive provides further complementary safeguards with regard to information to be provided to the holder of parental responsibility and mandatory access to a lawyer in order to take into account the specific needs of children.	(12) This Directive should be implemented taking into account the provisions of Directive 2012/13/EU and Directive 2013/48/EU. Information with regard to minor offences should be provided under the same conditions as provided for by Article 2(2) of Directive 2012/13/EU. However, this Directive provides further complementary safeguards with regard to information to be provided to a holder of parental responsibility and concerning assistance by a lawyer in order to take into account the specific needs of children.	(12) This Directive should be implemented taking into account the provisions of Directive 2012/13/EU and Directive 2013/48/EU. However, <i>information should also</i> be provided <i>with regard to minor offences, taking</i> into account the specific <i>vulnerabilities</i> of children. (AM 11)
(13) If a child is deprived of liberty, the Letter of Rights provided to the	(13) If a child is deprived of liberty, the Letter of Rights	(13) If a child is deprived of liberty, the Letter of Rights

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
child pursuant to Article 4 of Directive 2012/13/EU should include clear information on the child's rights under this Directive.	provided to the child pursuant to Article 4 of Directive 2012/13/EU should include clear information on the child's rights under this Directive.	provided to the child pursuant to Article 4 of Directive 2012/13/EU should include clear information on the child's rights under this Directive.
		(13a) Children should be informed promptly and directly about their rights with regard to the proceedings, the charges brought against them, the possible consequences and the available remedies. The information should be provided in writing and orally in a manner adapted to their age and maturity and in a language that they understand.(AM 12)
(14) The term "holder of parental responsibility" means any person having parental responsibility over a child as defined in Council Regulation (EC) 2201/2003 <sup>8</sup> . Parental responsibility means all rights and duties relating to the person or the property of a child which are given to	(14) The term "holder of parental responsibility" means any person having parental responsibility over a child as defined in Council Regulation (EC) 2201/2003. Parental responsibility means all rights and duties relating to the person or the property of a child	(14) The term "holder of parental responsibility" means any person having parental responsibility over a child as defined in Council Regulation (EC) 2201/2003. Parental responsibility means all rights and duties relating to the person or the property of a child

Council Regulation (EC) 2201/2003 of 27 November 2003 concerning jurisdiction and the recognition and enforcement of judgments in matrimonial matters and the matters of parental responsibility (OJ L 338, 23.12.2003, p. 1).

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
a natural or legal person by judgment, by operation of law or by an agreement having legal effect, including rights of custody and rights of access.	which are given to a natural or legal person by judgment, by operation of law or by an agreement having legal effect, including rights of custody and rights of access.	which are given to a natural or legal person by judgment, by operation of law or by an agreement having legal effect, including rights of custody and rights of access.
(15) Children should have the right to have the holder of parental responsibility informed about applicable procedural rights, either orally or in writing. This information should be provided promptly and in such detail as is necessary to safeguard the fairness of the proceedings and the effective exercise of the rights of defence of the child. Where it would be contrary to the best interests of the child to inform the holder of parental responsibility of those rights, another appropriate adult should be informed.	vulnerable and are not always able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings, Member States should inform a holder of parental responsibility about applicable procedural rights, either orally or in writing. If there are two holders of parental responsibility, Member States should inform both holders, unless this is not practicable. This information should be provided as soon as possible and in such detail as is necessary to safeguard the fairness of the proceedings and the effective exercise of the rights of defence of the child. In certain circumstances, the information should be provided to another appropriate adult nominated by the child or to a person designated by the competent	(15) Children should have the right also to have the holder of parental responsibility informed about applicable procedural rights, orally and in writing. This information should be provided promptly and in such detail as is necessary to safeguard the fairness of the proceedings and the effective exercise of the rights of defence of the child. Where it would be contrary to the best interests of the child to inform the holder of parental responsibility of those rights, another appropriate adult should be informed. (AM 13)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	authority. In the circumstance that no holder of parental responsibility can be reached or his or her identity is unknown, the Member States should only make use of the possibility to inform a person other than a holder of parental responsibilty when they have done concrete efforts to reach a holder of parental responsibilty or to obtain his or her identity.	
(16) Children should not be able to waive their right of access to a lawyer because they are not able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings. Therefore, the presence or assistance of a lawyer should be mandatory for children.	(16) Children have the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU. That Directive applies in its entirety, including, <i>inter alia</i> , the derogations for compelling reasons set out in Article 3(6) of that Directive. In no way, this Directive can limit the rights provided for in that Directive.	(16) Children should not be able to waive their right of access to a lawyer because they are not able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings. Therefore, the presence <i>and</i> assistance of a lawyer should be mandatory for children. (AM 14)
(17) In some Member States an authority other than a public prosecutor and a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters has competence for imposing penalties	[transferred in modified form to recitals 11a-11d]	[deleted] (AM 15)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
other than deprivation of liberty in relation to relatively minor offences. That may be the case, for example, in relation to traffic offences which are committed on a large scale and which might be established following a traffic control. In such situations, it would be unreasonable to require the competent authorities to ensure mandatory access to a lawyer. Where the law of a Member State provides for the imposition of a penalty regarding minor offences by such an authority and there is either a right of appeal or the possibility for the case to be otherwise referred to a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, mandatory access to a lawyer should therefore apply only to the proceedings before that court following such an appeal or referral. In some Member States proceedings involving children may be dealt with by public prosecutors who may impose penalties. In such proceedings children should have mandatory access to a lawyer.		
	(17) (new) Children are	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(ST 17633/13)	vulnerable and are not always able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings.  Therefore, where children have the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU, they should be assisted by a lawyer when they are questioned by the police or by other law enforcement or judicial authorities, including during the trial, or when they are deprived of liberty, unless the deprivation of liberty is supposed to last only for a short period of time, for example where the deprivation of liberty has as purpose to surrender the child to a holder of parental responsibility or to another appropriate adult designated by the competent authority, or to bring the child before a court in the event of an unexcused absence. When children should be assisted by a lawyer in accordance with this Directive, Member States should arrange a lawyer to assist the	(DS 1098/15)
	child concerned when such	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	lawyer has not been arranged by the child itself or by a holder of parental responsibilty.	
	(17a) For the purposes of this Directive, assistance by a lawyer means that the child is provided with legal support by the lawyer and that the child is represented by the lawyer during the criminal proceedings. When the child has to be assisted in accordance with this Directive during questioning, a lawyer has to be present. However, assistance by a lawyer does not mean that a lawyer has to be present during the criminal proceedings at moments other than during questioning; for instance, a lawyer does not have to be mandatory present during each investigative or evidence-gathering act. This does not prejudice the right of the child to have access to a lawyer during such acts, if he has the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	(17b) Where the child has to be assisted by a lawyer during questioning in accordance with this Directive, but no lawyer is present, the competent authorities shall postpone the questioning of the child for a reasonable period of time, so that the authorities can either await the arrival of the lawyer when the child has arranged a lawyer himself, or can arrange a lawyer for the child when this has not yet been done.	
(18) In some Member States certain minor offences, in particular minor traffic offences, minor offences in relation to general municipal regulations and minor public order offences, are considered to be criminal offences. It would be disproportionate to require the competent authorities to ensure mandatory access to a lawyer in respect of such minor offences. Where the law of a Member State provides that deprivation of liberty cannot be imposed as a penalty in respect of minor offences, the right to mandatory access to a lawyer should	[transferred in modified form to recitals 11a-11d]	[deleted] (AM 16)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
therefore apply only to proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters.		
(19) Children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings should have the right to an individual assessment to identify their specific needs in terms of protection, education, formation and social integration, to determine if and to what extent they would need special measures during the criminal proceedings and to determine the extent of their criminal responsibility and the adequacy of a penalty or educative measure for them	(19) Children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings should have the right to an individual assessment to identify their specific needs in terms of protection, education, formation and social integration, to determine if and to what extent they would need special measures during the criminal proceedings and to determine the extent of their criminal responsibility and the adequacy of a penalty or educative measure for them.	(19) Children who are suspected or accused in criminal proceedings should have the right to an individual assessment to identify their specific needs in terms of protection, education, formation and social integration, to ensure that every decision taken during, or resulting from, the proceedings is tailored to the greatest extent possible to their particular circumstances. (AM 17)
(20) In order to ensure the personal integrity of a child who is arrested or detained, the child should have access to a medical examination. The medical examination should be carried out by a physician.	(20) In order to ensure the personal integrity of a child who is arrested or detained, the child should have access to a medical examination.  Such medical examination should be carried out by a physician, either, when specific health indications or the general mental or physical constitution of the child give reasons for such	(20) In order to ensure the personal integrity, well-being and health of a suspected or accused child who is deprived of liberty, to assess his or her general physical and mental state, and any medical needs and to provide guidance on whether he or she should be subjected to questioning, investigative or evidence-taking measures, or any

Commission proposal	Council general approach	Orientation vote LIBE
(ST 17633/13)	(ST 10065/14)	(DS 1098/15)
	examination, on an initiative ex officio of the competent authorities, or following a request of the child or the holder of parental responsibility, or of the child's lawyer. However, no follow-up has to be given to a request for a medical examination when this would go against the best interests of the child, e.g. when the child has indicated that it does not want to be medically examined, or where the strain placed on and disadvantages likely to be suffered by the child as a result of the medical examination are disproportionate to the reasons for such examination (e.g. when the duration of deprivation of liberty would have to be extended by a not insignificant amount of time in order to carry out the examination and there is no need for immediate treatment). Member States should lay down practical arrangements concerning medical examinations.	special measures taken or envisaged concerning him or her, the child should have access to a medical examination. Suspected or accused children who are not deprived of liberty should have access to a medical examination where proceedings or the best interests of the child so require. The medical examination should be as non-invasive as possible and carried out by a qualified professional. (AM 18)

## Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)

## Council general approach (ST 10065/14)

## Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)

(21) In order to ensure sufficient protection of children who are not always able to understand the content of interviews to which they are subject, to avoid any challenge of the content of an interview and thereby undue repetition of questioning, questioning of children should be audio-visually recorded. This does not include questioning necessary to identify the child.

(21) In order to ensure sufficient protection of children who are not always able to understand the content of interviews to which they are subject, to avoid any challenge of the content of an interview and thereby undue repetition of questioning, questioning by police or other law enforcement authorities of children who are deprived of liberty should be audio-visually recorded when it is proportionate to do so. This **Directive does not require** Member States to make recordings of questioning of children by a judge or a court. Also, an audio-visual recording is not required when questioning has as sole purpose to verify the identity of the child or to determine whether an investigation should be started.

(21) Bearing in mind that children are particularly vulnerable, questioning may be perceived to be traumatic, therefore it is essential that questioning be carried out by trained professionals taking into consideration the children's age, maturity, level of understanding and any communication difficulties they may have. Questioning should take place in the presence of a lawyer and, where so requested by the child and/or where that is in the best interest of the child, the holder of parental responsibility and, where necessary, specialist professionals. Thorough documentation and audio-visual recording of interviews are a vital safeguard serving both to guarantee that interviews will be conducted properly and to ensure sufficient protection of children who are not always able to understand the content of interviews to which they are subject. *In order* to avoid any challenge of the content of an interview and thereby

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		undue repetition of questioning, questioning of children should <i>therefore</i> be audio-visually recorded. (AM 19)
(22) However, it would be disproportionate to require the competent authorities to ensure audiovisual recording in all circumstances. Due account should be taken of the complexity of the case, the seriousness of the alleged offence and the potential penalty that can be incurred. If a child is deprived of liberty before conviction, any questioning of the child should be audio-visually recorded.	[deleted]	(22) However, it would be unreasonable to require the competent authorities to ensure audio-visual recording even when it is not in the best interests of the child. If a child is deprived of liberty before conviction, any questioning of the child should be audio-visually recorded. (AM 20)
(23) Such audio-visual records should be accessible only to the judicial authorities and the parties to the proceedings. Moreover, the questioning of children should be carried out in a manner that takes into account their age and level of maturity.	(23) In all circumstances, whether the questioning of children is audio-visually recorded or not, questioning should be carried out in a manner that takes into account the age and level of maturity of the children concerned.	(23) Such audio-visual <i>recordings</i> should be accessible only to the judicial authorities and the parties to the proceedings. ( <i>AM 21</i> )
(24) When deciding the issue of legal	[deleted]	(24) When deciding the issue of

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
aid, Member States should aim at having rules which guarantee the effective exercise of the right to access to a lawyer for children.		legal aid, Member States should aim at having rules which guarantee the effective exercise of the right to access to a lawyer for children.
(25) Children are in a particularly vulnerable position in relation to detention. Special efforts should be undertaken to avoid deprivation of liberty of children given the inherent risks for their physical, mental and social development. The competent authorities should consider alternative measures and impose such measures whenever this is in the best interests of the child. This may include the obligation to report to a competent authority, a restriction on contact with specific persons, a requirement to undergo therapeutic treatment or treatment for addiction and participation in educational measures.	(25) Children are in a particularly vulnerable position in relation to detention. Special efforts should be undertaken to avoid detention of children at any stage of the proceedings before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence, given the inherent risks for their physical, mental and social development. The competent authorities should consider alternative measures instead of such detention and impose such measures whenever this is in the best interests of the child. Such alternative measures could include an obligation for the child not to be in certain places or an obligation for the child to reside in a specific place, restrictions of contact with specific persons, reporting obligations to the	(25) Children are in a particularly vulnerable position in relation to detention. Special efforts should be undertaken to avoid deprivation of liberty of children given the inherent risks for their physical, mental and social development and given that it seriously hampers their reintegration in society.  Deprivation of liberty should therefore be used only as a measure of last resort and for the shortest appropriate period of time. The competent authorities should consider alternative measures and impose such measures whenever this is in the best interests of the child. This may include the obligation to report to a competent authority, a restriction on contact with specific persons, a requirement to undergo therapeutic treatment or treatment for addiction and participation in educational

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	competent authorities, undergoing of therapeutic treatment or treatment for addiction subject to the child's consent, and participation in educational measures.	measures. (AM 22)
	(25a) Detention of children before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence should be subject to a periodic review by a court, which could also be a single judge. The periodic review may be carried out either ex officio by the court, or at the request of the child, of the child's lawyer or of a judical authority which is not a court, in particular a prosecutor. Member States should lay down practical arrangements in this respect. These arrangements may provide that if a periodic review is already being carried out ex officio by the court, no follow-up has to be given to a request of the child or of the child's lawyer to carry out such review.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(26) When deprivation of liberty is imposed on children, they should benefit from special protection measures. In particular they should be held separately from adults unless it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so, in accordance with Article 37(c) of the United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, there should be the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the case. Particular attention should be paid to the way detained children are treated given their inherent vulnerability. Children should have access to educational facilities according to their needs.	at any stage of the proceedings before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence, they should benefit from special protection measures. In particular they should be held separately from adults unless it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so, in accordance with Article 37(c) of the United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, there should be the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the case. Particular attention should be paid to the way detained children are treated given their inherent vulnerability. Children should have access to educational facilities according to their needs.	(26) When deprivation of liberty is imposed on children, they should benefit from special protection measures. In particular they should always be held separately from adults unless in exceptional circumstances it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so, in accordance with Article 37(c) of the United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, there should be the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the case. Particular attention should be paid to the way detained children are treated given their inherent vulnerability. Children should have access to educational facilities according to their needs. (AM 23)
	(26a) Children may be detained with young adults unless these	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	persons are not suited for joint accommodation with children. Member States should determine which persons are considered to be young adults in accordance with their national law and procedures. Member States are encouraged to determine that persons older than 24 years cannot qualify as young adults.	
		(26a) Children deprived of liberty should in particular have the right to maintain regular and meaningful contact with parents, family and friends through visits and correspondence, unless exceptional restrictions are required in the best interests of the child and in the interests of justice. (AM 24)
(27) Professionals in direct contact with children should take into account the particular needs of children of different age groups and should take care that the proceedings are adapted to them. For that purpose, they should be specially trained in dealing with	(27) Professionals in direct contact with children should take into account the particular needs of children of different age groups and should take care that the proceedings are adapted to them. For that purpose, they should be	(27) Professionals in direct contact with children should take into account the particular needs of children of different age groups and should take care that the proceedings are adapted to them. For that purpose, they should be

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
children.	specially trained in dealing with children.	specially trained in dealing with children.
	(27a) Children should be treated in a manner appropriate to their age, their special needs, their maturity and level of understanding, and bearing in mind any communication difficulties they may have.	
(28) Children should be judged in the absence of the public in order to protect their privacy and to facilitate their re-integration into society. In exceptional cases the court may decide that a hearing should be held publicly after it has taken due account of the best interests of the child.	(28) Taking into acount the differences between the legal traditions and systems between the Member States, the privacy of children during criminal proceedings should be ensured in the best possible way with a view, inter alia, to facilitating the reintegration of children into society. To this end, Member States should make a balancing exercise by taking due account, on the one hand, of the best interests of children, which could for instance be achieved by setting as a principle that trials against children be organised in	(28) Children should be judged in the absence of the public in order to protect their privacy and to facilitate their re-integration into society. The court should be allowed to hold a hearing in public only in exceptional cases, when in the best interests of the child. Such a decision should be open for appeal by the child. Member States should take appropriate measures to ensure that the competent authorities do not commit violations of privacy of children in connection with criminal proceedings and their outcome. They should also seek to prevent

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	the absence of the public, by protecting the personal characteristics of the child that are taken into account and derive from the individual assessment foreseen in this Directive, by protecting the audio-visual recordings made during questioning and by avoiding that any inappropriate use of these recordings is made, or by protecting the images of the child and its family members and, on the other hand, of the general principle of a public hearing.	breaches of privacy that might be committed through the media, including the Internet. Furthermore, Member States should facilitate the reintegration into society of children involved in criminal proceedings, and should actively take steps in order to prevent discrimination and marginalisation of such children. (AM 25)
		(28a) Member States should ensure that no information or personal data is made available or published, particularly in the media, which could reveal or indirectly enable the disclosure of the child's identity, including the image or the name of the child or the child's family. (AM 26)
		(28b) Member States should ensure that when records or documents containing personal and sensitive

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		data of children are transferred, that transfer complies with relevant data protection legislation. (AM 27)
		(28c) Member States should consider ensuring that the protection of privacy as set out in this Directive extends after the child reaches the age of 18 and throughout his or her lifetime, avoiding stigmatization, prejudgments and/or enhancing future sentencing. (AM 28)
(29) In order to ensure appropriate assistance and support of children, the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult should have access to the court hearings involving the suspected or accused child.	(29) Since children are vulnerable and are not always able to fully understand and follow criminal proceedings, they should have the right to be accompanied by a holder of parental responsibility or by another appropriate adult during court hearings in which they are involved. Where there are two holders of parental responsibility, the child should have the right to be accompanied by both holders, unless this is contrary to the best	(29) In order to ensure appropriate assistance and support of children, the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult should have access to the court hearings involving the suspected or accused child.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	interests of the child. Where it is not possible for a holder of parental responsibility to accompany the child, or where no holder of parental responsibility is willing to do so, where it would be contrary to the best interests of the child to be accompanied by a holder of parental responsibility, or where the presence of a holder of parental responsibility could prejudice the criminal proceedings, including when the presence of a holder of parental responsibility could seriously endanger the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person, the child has the right to be accompanied by another appropriate adult.	
	(29a) In the case the child has chosen an adult that is not acceptable to the court, the competent authority should designate another appropriate adult that is acceptable to the court. In the case the child has not designated another appropriate adult, the competent	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	authority could designate an appropriate adult that is acceptable to the court. The appropriate adult can be the same adult that was provided with information that the child receives regarding his rights, or another appropriate adult, who can also be a person belonging to an authority or other institution responsible for the protection or welfare of children. Member States should lay down practical arrangements regarding the presence of accompanying persons during the court hearing. These arrangements could include provisions concerning a delay in the arrival of accompanying persons, and concerning the conditions under which an accompanying person can be temporarily excluded from the court hearing.	
(30) The right of an accused person to appear in person at the trial is based on the right to a fair trial provided for in Article 6 of the European Convention for the Protection of	(30) The right of an accused person to appear in person at the trial is based on the right to a fair trial provided for in Article 6 of the European Convention for the	(30) The right of an accused person to appear in person at the trial is based on the right to a fair trial provided for in Article 6 of the European Convention for the

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted by the European Court of Human Rights.	Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted by the European Court of Human Rights. Member States should take appropriate measures to promote that children are present at their trial, including by summoning them in person and by sending a copy of the summons to a holder of parental responsibility or, where that would be contrary to the best interests of the child, to another appropriate adult designated by the competent authority. Member States should lay down practical arrangements regarding the presence of the child at their trial. These arrangements could include provisions concerning the conditions under which a child can be temporarily excluded from the trial.	Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted by the European Court of Human Rights.
		(30a) Member States should ensure that children have the right to appear in person and to participate actively in the trial, including by giving them the opportunity to be

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		heard and to express their views when they are deemed to have a sufficient understanding of the procedure. (AM 29)
(31) The rights provided for by this Directive should apply to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time they are arrested in the executing Member State.	(31) The rights provided for by this Directive should apply to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time they are arrested in the executing Member State.	(31) The rights provided for by this Directive should apply to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time they are arrested in the executing Member State.
	(31a) The surrender procedure is crucial for cooperation in criminal matters between the Member States. Observance of the time-limits contained in Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA is essential for such cooperation. Therefore, while children should be able to exercise their rights under this Directive in European arrest warrant proceedings, those time-limits should be respected.	
(32) Any individual assessment, medical examination and audio-visual	(32) An individual assessment, medical examination and audio-	(32) Any individual assessment, medical examination and audio-

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
recording provided for by this Directive should be carried out free of charge for the child.	visual recording provided for by this Directive should be carried out free of charge for the child. The Member States will assume the relevant costs, unless they are covered in any other way, e.g. through a medical insurance.  However, without prejudice to national rules concerning the bearing of costs of criminal proceedings and without prejudice to national rules on legal aid, Member States may provide case-by-case assessment on the fairness of reimbursement of those costs by the convicted child. To that end, the potential consequence on the child's general mental and physical development, including education and professional future, should be taken into account.	visual recording provided for by this Directive should be carried out free of charge for the child.
(33) In order to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of this Directive, there is a need for collection of data by the Member States with regard to the implementation of the rights set out in this Directive. Relevant data	(33) In order to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of this Directive, there is a need for collection of <b>relevant</b> data, <b>from</b> available data, with regard to the implementation of the rights set out	(33) In order to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of this Directive, there is a need for collection of data by the Member States with regard to the implementation of the rights set out

<b>Commission proposal</b>
(ST 17633/13)

Council general approach (ST 10065/14)

### Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)

include data recorded by the judicial authorities and by law enforcement authorities and, as far as possible, administrative data compiled by healthcare and social welfare services as regards the rights set out in this Directive, in particular in relation to the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audio-visually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.

in this Directive. **Such** relevant data include data recorded by the judicial authorities and by law enforcement authorities and, as far as possible, administrative data compiled by healthcare and social welfare services as regards the rights set out in this Directive, in particular in relation to the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audio-visually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.

in this Directive. Relevant data include data recorded by the judicial authorities and by law enforcement authorities and, as far as possible, administrative data compiled by healthcare and social welfare services as regards the rights set out in this Directive, in particular in relation to the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audio-visually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.

(34) This Directive upholds the fundamental rights and principles as recognised by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, including the prohibition of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment, the right to liberty and security, respect for private and family life, the right to the integrity of the person, the rights of the child, integration of persons with

(34) This Directive upholds the fundamental rights and principles as recognised by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, including the prohibition of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment, the right to liberty and security, respect for private and family life, the right to the integrity of the person, the

(34) This Directive upholds the fundamental rights and principles as recognised by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union and the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, including the prohibition of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment, the right to liberty and security, respect for private and family life, the right to the integrity of the person, the rights

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
disabilities, the right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial, the presumption of innocence and the rights of defence. This Directive should be implemented in accordance with those rights and principles.	rights of the child, integration of persons with disabilities, the right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial, the presumption of innocence and the rights of defence. This Directive should be implemented in accordance with those rights and principles.	of the child, integration of persons with disabilities, the right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial, the presumption of innocence and the rights of defence. This Directive should be implemented in accordance with those rights and principles.
(35) This Directive sets minimum rules. Member States may extend the rights set out in this Directive in order to provide a higher level of protection. Such higher level of protection should not constitute an obstacle to the mutual recognition of judicial decisions that those minimum rules are designed to facilitate. The level of protection should never fall below the standards provided by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union or the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted in the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union and the European Court of Human Rights.	(35) This Directive sets minimum rules. Member States may extend the rights set out in this Directive in order to provide a higher level of protection. Such higher level of protection should not constitute an obstacle to the mutual recognition of judicial decisions that those minimum rules are designed to facilitate. The level of protection should never fall below the standards provided by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union or the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted in the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union and the European Court of Human Rights.	(35) This Directive sets minimum rules. Member States may extend the rights set out in this Directive in order to provide a higher level of protection. Such higher level of protection should not constitute an obstacle to the mutual recognition of judicial decisions that those minimum rules are designed to facilitate. The level of protection should never fall below the standards provided by the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union or the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as interpreted in the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Union and the European Court of Human Rights.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
(36) Since the objectives of this Directive, namely setting common minimum standards on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings, cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, but can rather, by reason of the scale of the measure, be better achieved at Union level, the Union may adopt measures in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity as set out in Article 5 of the Treaty on the European Union. In accordance with the principle of proportionality as set out in that Article, this Directive does not go beyond what is necessary in order to achieve these objectives.	(36) Since the objectives of this Directive, namely setting common minimum standards on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings, cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, but can rather, by reason of the scale of the measure, be better achieved at Union level, the Union may adopt measures in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity as set out in Article 5 of the Treaty on the European Union. In accordance with the principle of proportionality as set out in that Article, this Directive does not go beyond what is necessary in order to achieve these objectives.	(36) Since the objectives of this Directive, namely setting common minimum standards <i>across the Union</i> on procedural safeguards for children suspected or accused in criminal proceedings, cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, but can rather, by reason of the scale of the measure, be better achieved at Union level, the Union may adopt measures in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity as set out in Article 5 of the Treaty on the European Union. In accordance with the principle of proportionality as set out in that Article, this Directive does not go beyond what is necessary in order to achieve these objectives. ( <i>AM 30</i> )
(37) [In accordance with Articles 3 of Protocol No 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, those Member States have notified their wish to participate	(37) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and without prejudice to Article 4 of that	(37) [In accordance with Articles 3 of Protocol No 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, those Member States have notified their wish to

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)
in the adoption and application of this Directive] OR [In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and without prejudice to Article 4 of that Protocol, those Member States are not taking part in the adoption of this Directive and are not bound by it or subject to its application] <sup>9</sup> ;	Protocol, those Member States are not taking part in the adoption of this Directive and are not bound by it or subject to its application. ()	participate in the adoption and application of this Directive] OR [In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol 21 on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland in respect of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice, annexed to the Treaty on European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and without prejudice to Article 4 of that Protocol, those Member States are not taking part in the adoption of this Directive and are not bound by it or subject to its application];
(38) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol No 22 on the position of Denmark, annexed to the Treaty on the European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, Denmark is not taking part in the adoption of this Directive, and is not bound by it or subject to its application.	(38) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol No 22 on the position of Denmark, annexed to the Treaty on the European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, Denmark is not taking part in the adoption of this Directive, and is not bound by it or subject to its application.	(38) In accordance with Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol No 22 on the position of Denmark, annexed to the Treaty on the European Union and to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, Denmark is not taking part in the adoption of this Directive, and is not bound by it or subject to its application.

The final wording of this recital in the Directive will depend on the position of the United Kingdom and Ireland taken in accordance with the provisions of Protocol No 21.

<b>Commission</b> p	proposal
(ST 17633	<b>3/13</b> )

### Council general approach (ST 10065/14)

## Orientation vote LIBE (DS 1098/15)

(39) In accordance with the Joint Political Declaration of Member States and the Commission of 28 September 2011 on explanatory documents 10, Member States have undertaken to accompany, in justified cases, the notification of their transposition measures with one or more documents explaining the relationship between the components of a directive and the corresponding of national transposition parts instruments. With regard to this Directive, the legislator considers the transmission of such documents to be justified,

(39) In accordance with the Joint Political Declaration of Member States and the Commission of 28 September 2011 on explanatory documents<sup>11</sup>, Member States have undertaken to accompany, in justified cases, the notification of their transposition measures with one or more documents explaining the relationship between the components of a directive and the corresponding parts of national transposition instruments. With regard to this Directive, the legislator considers the transmission of such documents to be justified,

(39) In accordance with the Joint Political Declaration of Member States and the Commission of 28 September 2011 on explanatory documents 12, Member States have undertaken to accompany, in justified cases, the notification of their transposition measures with one or more documents explaining the relationship between the components of a directive and the corresponding parts of national transposition instruments. With regard to this Directive, the legislator considers the transmission of such documents to be justified,

OJ C 369, 17.12.2011, p. 14.

OJ C 369, 17.12.2011, p. 14.

OJ C 369, 17.12.2011, p. 14.

#### **ARTICLES**

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTORY PROVISIONS

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Subject matter	Subject matter	Subject matter
This Directive lays down minimum rules concerning certain rights of suspects or accused persons in criminal proceedings who are children and of children subject to a surrender procedure pursuant to Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA <sup>13</sup> ("European arrest warrant proceedings").	This Directive lays down minimum rules concerning certain rights of suspects or accused persons in criminal proceedings who are children and of children subject to a surrender procedure pursuant to Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA ("European arrest warrant proceedings").	This Directive lays down minimum rules concerning certain rights of suspects or accused persons in criminal proceedings who are children and of children subject to a surrender procedure pursuant to Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA ("European arrest warrant proceedings").

Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA of 13 June 2002 on the European arrest warrant and the surrender procedures between Member States (OJ L 190, 18.7.2002, p.1).

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Scope	Scope	Scope
1. This Directive applies to children subject to criminal proceedings from the time when they become suspected or accused of having committed an offence and until the conclusion of the criminal proceedings.	1. This Directive applies to children subject to criminal proceedings from the time when they are made aware by the competent authorities of a Member State that they are suspected or accused of having committed a criminal offence. It applies until the conclusion of the proceedings, which is understood to mean the final determination of the question whether the suspect or accused person has committed the offence, including, where applicable, sentencing and the resolution of any appeal.	1. This Directive applies to children subject to criminal proceedings from the time when they become suspected or accused of having committed an offence and until the conclusion of the criminal proceedings.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
2. This Directive applies to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State.	2. This Directive applies to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings (requested persons) from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State in accordance with Article 17.	2. This Directive applies to children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings from the time of their arrest in the executing Member State.
3. This Directive applies to suspects or accused persons subject to criminal proceedings referred to in paragraph 1, and to persons subject to European arrest warrant proceedings referred to in paragraph 2, who are no longer children in the course of those proceedings, which started when they were children.	3. Member States may provide that this Directive, in particular Articles 4, 7, 8, 10 and 16 thereof, shall apply also to suspects or accused persons subject to criminal proceedings referred to in paragraph 1, and to persons subject to European arrest warrant proceedings referred to in paragraph 2, who were children when they became subject to these proceedings, but who subsequently have become of age.	3. This Directive applies to suspects or accused persons subject to criminal proceedings referred to in paragraph 1, and to persons subject to European arrest warrant proceedings referred to in paragraph 2, who are no longer children but are still under the age of 21 at the beginning of those proceedings, which relate to offences allegedly committed before those persons had reached the age of 18 (AM 31)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
4. This Directive also applies to children other than suspected or accused who, in the course of questioning by the police or by another law enforcement authority, become suspects or accused persons.	4. This Directive also applies to children other than suspected or accused who, in the course of questioning by the police or by another law enforcement authority, become suspects or accused persons.	4. This Directive also applies to children other than suspected or accused who, in the course of questioning by the police or by another law enforcement authority, become suspects or accused persons.
5. This Directive does not affect national rules determining the age of criminal responsibility.	5. This Directive does not affect national rules determining the age of criminal responsibility.	5. This Directive does not affect national rules determining the age of criminal responsibility.
	5a. Without prejudice to the right to a fair trial, in respect of minor offences:  (a) where the law of a Member State provides for the imposition of a sanction by an authority other than a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters, and the imposition of such a sanction may be appealed or referred to such a court; or  (b) where deprivation of liberty cannot be imposed as a sanction,	

this Directive shall only apply to the proceedings before a court having jurisdiction in criminal matters.  In any event, this Directive shall fully apply where the child is deprived of liberty, irrespective of the stage of the criminal proceedings.	
6. This Directive does not apply to proceedings in relation to children who have committed an act qualified as an offence, where these proceedings may not lead to the imposition of any criminal sanction, but which may lead to the imposition of restrictive measures on children.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Definition	Definition	Definitions
For the purposes of this Directive the term "child" means a person below the age of 18 years.	For the purposes of this Directive the term "child" means a person below the age of 18 years.	For the purposes of this Directive the following definitions apply:  - "child" means a person below the age of 18 years. Where, even after checks, doubts remain about a person's age, that person shall, for all purposes, be presumed to be a child. (AM 32)  - "holder of parental responsibility" means any person having parental responsibility over a child as defined in Article 2(7) of Council Regulation (EC) No 2201/2003 (AM 33).

# CHAPTER 2 RIGHT TO INFORMATION OF CHILDREN

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to information of children	Information to be provided to children	Right to information of children
1. Member States shall ensure that children are informed promptly about their rights in accordance with Directive 2012/13/EU. They shall also be informed about the following rights within the same scope as Directive 2012/13/EU:	1. Member States shall ensure that children are informed promptly about their rights in accordance with Directive 2012/13/EU. They shall also be informed <b>promptly</b> about their rights <b>and entitlements on the following issues</b> , where and when these rights and entitlements apply:	1. Member States shall ensure that children are informed promptly – in writing and orally, by procedures appropriate to their age, understanding, and intellectual ability, in a simple language which the child understands – about the charges against them, the conduct of the proceedings and their rights in accordance with Directive 2012/13/EU, including the following rights: (AM 34)
(1) their right to have the holders of parental responsibility informed as provided for in Article 5;	(a) <b>the information to be given to a</b> holder of parental responsibility, as provided for in Article 5;	(1) their right to have the holders of parental responsibility informed as provided for in Article 5;
<ul><li>(2) their right to a lawyer, as provided for in Article 6;</li><li>(3) their right to an individual</li></ul>	<ul><li>(b) the right of access to a lawyer, as provided for in Article 6;</li><li>(c) the assistance by a lawyer, as</li></ul>	(2) their right to <i>be assisted by</i> a lawyer, as provided for in Article 6; (AM 35)

assessment, as provided for in Article 7;

- (4) their right to a medical examination, as provided for in Article 8;
- (5) their right to liberty and the right to specific treatment in detention, as provided for in Articles 10 and 12;
- (6) their right to protection of privacy, as provided for in Article 14;
- (7) their right that the holders of parental responsibility have access to the court hearings, as provided for in Article 15;
- (8) their right to appear in person at the trial, as provided for in Article 16;
- (9) their right to legal aid, as provided for in Article 18.

#### provided for in Article 6a;

- (d) the individual assessment, as provided for in Article 7;
- (e) **the access to** medical examination, as provided for in Article 8;
- (f) the **limitation of detention and use of alternative measures**, as provided for in Article 10;
- (g) the specific treatment in detention, as provided for in Article 12;
- (h) the protection of privacy, as provided for in Article 14;
- (i) the right to be accompanied by an adult during the court hearings, as provided for in Article 15;
- (j) the right to appear in person at the trial, as provided for in Article 16;
- (k) legal aid, as provided for in Article 18.

- (3) their right to an individual assessment, as provided for in Article 7;
- (4) their right to a medical examination, as provided for in Article 8;
- (5) their right to liberty and the right to specific treatment *when arrested or* in detention, as provided for in Articles 10 and 12; *(AM 36)*
- (6) their right to protection of privacy, as provided for in Article 14;
- (7) their right that the holders of parental responsibility have access to the court hearings, as provided for in Article 15;
- (8) their right to appear in person at the trial, as provided for in Article 16;
- (9) their right to legal aid, as provided for in Article 18.
- (9a) their right to effective remedies, as provided for in Article 18a. (AM 37)

		(9b) their right of access to justice which is adapted to their needs (AM 38)
2. Member States shall ensure that, where children are deprived of liberty the Letter of Rights given to them pursuant to Directive 2012/13/EU includes their rights under this Directive.	where children are <b>arrested or detained</b> , the Letter of Rights given to them pursuant to Directive	2. Member States shall ensure that, where children are deprived of liberty the Letter of Rights given to them pursuant to Directive 2012/13/EU includes their rights under this Directive.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right of the child to have the holder of parental responsibility informed	Information to be provided to a holder of parental responsibility	Right of the child to have the holder of parental responsibility informed
Member States shall ensure that the holder of parental responsibility of the child or, where that would be contrary to the best interests of the child, another appropriate adult, is provided with the information that the child receives in accordance with Article 4.	1. Member States shall ensure that a holder of parental responsibility is provided <b>as soon as possible</b> with the information that the child receives in accordance with Article 4.	Member States shall ensure that the holder of parental responsibility or, where that is impossible or would be contrary to the best interests of the child, another appropriate adult, to be designated by the child and approved by the competent authority or – if the child has not designated any such person – a person designated by the competent authority and accepted by the child, is provided as quickly as possible with the information that the child receives in accordance with Article 4. (AM 39)
	2. Where providing the information referred to in paragraph 1 to a holder of parental responsibility	
	<ul><li>(a) would be contrary to the best interests of the child;</li><li>(b) could jeopardise the criminal</li></ul>	

proceedings; or

(c) is not possible, because no holder of parental responsibility can be reached or his/her identity is unknown,

the information shall be provided to another appropriate adult, nominated by the child and accepted as such by the competent authority, or to a person designated by the competent authority, who can also be an authority or other institution responsible for the protection or welfare of children.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right of a mandatory access to a lawyer	Right of access to a lawyer	Right to mandatory <u>assistance by</u> a lawyer (AM 40)
1. Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer throughout the criminal proceedings in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU. The right to access to a lawyer cannot be waived.	Member States shall ensure that children have the right of access to a lawyer throughout the criminal proceedings in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU.	1. Member States shall ensure that children are assisted by a lawyer <i>at every stage in</i> the proceedings. The right to <i>be assisted by</i> a lawyer cannot be waived. ( <i>AM 41</i> )
		1a. The derogations provided for in Directive 2013/48/EU shall not apply to children. (AM 42)
2. The right to access to a lawyer shall also apply to criminal proceedings that may lead to the final dismissal of the case by the prosecutor after the child has complied with certain conditions.	[deleted]	The right to access to a lawyer shall also apply to criminal proceedings that may lead to the final dismissal of the case by the prosecutor after the child has complied with certain conditions.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
	Assistance by a lawyer	
	1. Member States shall ensure that children, who have the right of access to a lawyer in accordance with Article 6, are assisted by a lawyer in the following situations:	
	(a) when they are questioned by the police, or by other law enforcement or judicial authorities, including during the trial, unless this is not proportionate taking account of the following elements:	
	<ul><li>i) the complexity of the case;</li><li>ii) the seriousness of the alleged offence;</li></ul>	
	iii) the maximum penalty that can reasonably be expected to be imposed.	
	(b) when they are deprived of liberty, unless the deprivation of liberty is supposed to last only for a short period of time.	
	2. Where the child has to be	

assisted by a lawyer in accordance with this Article but no lawyer is present, the competent authorities shall postpone the questioning of the child for a reasonable period of time. However, in exceptional circumstances and only during the pre-trial stage, the competent authorities may immediately proceed with the questioning when, in the light of the particular circumstances of the case, this is justified on the basis of one of the following compelling reasons:

- (a) where there is an urgent need to avert serious adverse consequences for the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person;
- (b) where immediate action by the investigating authorities is imperative to prevent substantial jeopardy to criminal proceedings.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right of an individual assessment	Individual assessment	Right of an individual assessment
1. Member States shall ensure that the specific needs of children concerning protection, education, training and social integration are taken into account.	1. Member States shall ensure that the specific needs of children concerning protection, education, training and social integration are taken into account.	1. Member States shall ensure that the specific needs of children concerning protection, education, training and social integration are taken into account.
2. For that purpose children shall be individually assessed. The assessment shall take particular account of the personality and maturity of the child and their economic and social background.	2. For that purpose children shall be individually assessed. The assessment shall take particular account of the personality and maturity of the child and their <b>familial</b> and social background.	2. For that purpose children shall be individually assessed. The assessment shall take particular account of the personality and maturity of the child, its <i>family</i> , economic and social background, <i>its living environment and any specific vulnerabilities</i> . (AM 43)
3. The individual assessment shall take place at an appropriate stage of the proceedings and in any event before indictment.	3. The individual assessment shall take place at the earliest appropriate stage of the proceedings and, at the latest, in due time for it to be taken into account by the court when sentencing.	3. The individual assessment shall take place at <i>the earliest</i> appropriate stage of the proceedings and in any event before indictment or the ordering of measures involving deprivation of liberty, except where this is impossible. (AM 44)
4. The extent and detail of the	4. The extent and detail of the	4. The extent and detail of the

individual assessment may vary depending on the circumstances of the case, the seriousness of the alleged offence and the penalty which will be imposed if the child is found guilty of the alleged offence, whether or not the child has previously come to the attention of competent authorities in the context of criminal proceedings.

individual assessment may vary depending on the circumstances of the case, the seriousness of the alleged offence and the penalty which will be imposed if the child is found guilty of the alleged offence, whether or not the child has **in the past** come to the attention of competent authorities in the context of criminal proceedings.

individual assessment may vary depending on the circumstances of the case, *taking into account the best interests of the child*.

The assessment shall serve to establish and record such information about the individual characteristics and circumstances of the child as might be of use to the competent authority in order to:

- (a) determine whether special measures concerning the child should be taken during the proceedings;
- (b) assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of any precautionary measures;
- (c) take decisions within its remit arising from the proceedings. (AM 45)

- 5. Individual assessments shall be carried out with the close involvement of the child.
- 5. Individual assessments shall be carried out with the close involvement of the child.
- 5. Individual assessments shall be carried out with the close involvement of the child. They shall be carried out by qualified personnel, following a multidisciplinary approach and, where deemed advisable, with the

		involvement of the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult and/or specialist professional. (AM 46)
6. If the elements that form the basis of the individual assessment change significantly, Member States shall ensure that the individual assessment is updated throughout the criminal proceedings.		6. If the elements that form the basis of the individual assessment change significantly, Member States shall ensure that the individual assessment is updated throughout the criminal proceedings.
7. Member States may derogate from the obligation in paragraph 1 when it is not proportionate to carry out an individual assessment taking into account the circumstances of the case and whether or not the child has previously come to the attention of Member State authorities in the context of criminal proceedings.	7. Member States may derogate from the obligation in paragraphs 1 and 2 when it is not proportionate to carry out an individual assessment taking into account the circumstances of the case, including the lack of seriousness of the alleged offence, and whether or not the child has in the past come to the attention of Member State authorities in the context of criminal proceedings.	7. Member States may derogate from the obligation to carry out an individual assessment, if the derogation is warranted by the circumstances of the case and it is in the best interests of the child. (AM 47)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to medical examination	Access to medical examination	Right to medical examination
1. In case of deprivation of liberty of a child, Member States shall ensure that the child has access to a medical examination with a view, in particular, to assessing the general mental and physical condition of the child with the aim to determine the capacity of the child to face questioning or other investigative or evidence gathering acts or any measures taken or envisaged against the child.	1. In case of deprivation of liberty of a child, Member States shall ensure that the child has access to a medical examination with a view, in particular, to assessing the general mental and physical condition of the child. ()	1. Where a child has been deprived of liberty, where the proceedings so require, or where it is in the best interests of the child, Member States shall ensure that the child has access without delay to a medical examination and medical care in order to evaluate, protect and, where necessary, improve the health and the well-being of the child. The medical examination shall be as non-invasive as possible and carried out by a qualified professional.
		1a. The results of that medical examination shall be taken into account when determining the capacity of the child to face questioning or other investigative or evidence gathering acts or any measures taken or envisaged against the child. (AM 48)
2. The following persons shall	2. The medical examination shall	2. The following persons shall

have the right to ask for a medical examination:  (a) the child,  (b) the holder of the parental responsibility or the appropriate adult referred to in Article 5;  (c) the child's lawyer.	be carried out either ex officio by the competent authorities, when specific health indications or the general mental or physical constitution of the child give reasons for such a medical examination, or following a request by any of the following persons:  (a) the child,  (b) a holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult referred to in Article 5;  (c) the child's lawyer.  A request for a medical examination may be refused if it is obvious that such request has been made with the sole purpose of delaying the criminal proceedings. In the cases of (b) and (c), the request can also be rejected if the examination would go against the best interests of the child.	have the right to ask for a medical examination:  (a) the child,  (b) the holder of the parental responsibility or the appropriate adult referred to in Article 5;  (c) the child's lawyer.
3. The conclusion of the medical examination shall be recorded in writing.	3. The conclusion of the medical examination shall be recorded in writing.	3. The conclusion of the medical examination shall be recorded in writing and all steps necessary to protect the physical and mental health of the child shall be taken

		without delay. (AM 49)
4. Member States shall ensure that the medical examination is repeated where the circumstances so require.	4. Member States shall ensure that the medical examination is repeated where the circumstances so require.	4. Member States shall ensure that the medical examination is repeated where the circumstances so require.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Questioning of children	Questioning of children	Questioning of children
1. Member States shall ensure that any questioning of children by police or other law enforcement or judicial authority carried out prior to the indictment is audio-visually recorded, unless it is not proportionate taking into account the complexity of the case, the seriousness of the alleged offence and the potential penalty that can be incurred.	1. Member States shall ensure that questioning of children by police or other law enforcement authorities carried out prior to the submission of the merits of the accusation before a court may be audio-visually recorded.	1. Member States shall ensure that any questioning of children by police or other law enforcement or judicial authority carried out is audio-visually recorded, unless <i>it</i> is not <i>in the best interests of the child</i> . (AM 50)
2. In any event, the questioning of children shall be audio-visually recorded where the child is deprived of liberty, irrespective of the stage of the criminal proceedings.	2. When children are deprived of liberty, Member States shall ensure that questioning as referred to in paragraph 1 shall be audio-visually recorded when this is proportionate, taking account of the following elements:	2. In any event, the questioning of children shall be audio-visually recorded where the child is deprived of liberty, irrespective of the stage of the criminal proceedings.
	(a) the complexity of the case;	
	(b) the seriousness of the alleged offence;	
	(c) the maximum penalty that can be imposed or that can reasonably	

	be expected to be imposed.	
	2a. However, as an exception to paragraph 2, Member States may decide not to proceed to an audiovisual recording when the questioning takes place in the presence of a lawyer.	
		2a. Member States shall ensure that the questioning of children is carried out in a manner that takes account of their age, level of maturity and any other needs determined during the individual assessment conducted in accordance with Article 7. (AM 51)
3. Paragraph 1 is without prejudice to the possibility to ask questions for the purpose of personal identification of the child without such audio-visual recording.	3. When it is proportionate to make an audio-visual recording in accordance with paragraph 2 but an unforeseeable technical problem renders it impossible to make such recording, the police or other law enforcement authorities may question the child without an audio-visual recording if questioning of the child is imperative	3. Paragraph 1 is without prejudice to the possibility to ask questions <i>solely</i> for the purpose of personal identification of the child without such audio-visual recording. (AM 52)
	a) because of an urgent need to avert serious adverse consequences	

for the life, liberty or physical integrity of a person; or  b) to prevent substantial jeopardy to criminal proceedings.	
4. <b>This Article</b> is without prejudice to the possibility to ask questions for the purpose of personal identification of the child without such audio-visual recording.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to liberty	Limitation of detention and use of alternative measures	Right to liberty
1. Member States shall ensure that children are deprived of liberty before their conviction only as a measure of last resort and for the shortest appropriate period of time. Due account shall be taken of the age and individual situation of the child.	1. Member States shall ensure that detention of a child at any stage of the proceedings before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence, shall only be a measure of last resort and for the shortest appropriate period of time. Due account shall be taken of the age and individual situation of the child, and of the particular circumstances of the case.	1. Member States shall ensure that children are deprived of liberty before their conviction only as a measure of last resort, after specific and detailed reasons have been given, and for the shortest appropriate period of time, ensuring in every case respect for the human dignity and the rights of the child in custody. Due account shall be taken of the age, individual situation and personality of the child and the particular circumstances under which the offence was committed. (AM 53)
2. Member States shall ensure that any deprivation of liberty of children before their conviction is subject to a periodic review by a court.	2. Member States shall ensure that any detention as referred to in paragraph 1 is subject to a periodic review by a court. Such review shall be carried out either ex officio by the court, or at the request of the child, of the child's lawyer, or of a judicial authority which is not a	2. Member States shall ensure that any deprivation of liberty of children before their conviction is subject to a periodic review, at reasonable intervals of time, by a court. Every child deprived of liberty shall have the right to challenge the legality of the deprivation of liberty before a court

court.	or other competent, independent and impartial authority, and to a prompt decision on any such challenge. (AM 54)
3. Member States shall ensure that, wherever possible, the competent authorities shall have recourse to alternative measures instead of detention as referred to in paragraph 1.	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		Provisional detention
		Member States shall ensure that children placed in provisional detention are kept separately from adults and convicted children. (AM 55)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Alternative measures	Alternative measures	Alternative measures
1. Member States shall ensure that, where the conditions for deprivation of liberty are fulfilled, the competent authorities have recourse to alternative measures, wherever possible.	[deleted / moved to Article 10 and recitals]	1. Member States shall ensure that, where the conditions for deprivation of liberty are fulfilled, the competent authorities have recourse to alternative measures, wherever possible.
2. The alternative measures may include:		2. The alternative measures may include:
(a) an obligation for the child to reside in a specific place,		(a) an obligation for the child to reside in a specific place,
(b) restrictions of contact with specific persons,		(b) restrictions of contact with specific persons,
(c) reporting obligations to the competent authorities,		(c) reporting obligations to the competent authorities,
(d) undergoing of therapeutic treatment or treatment for addiction,		(d) participation in therapeutic or addiction treatment programmes, (AM 56)
(e) participation in educational measures.		(e) participation in educational <i>programmes</i> . (AM 57)

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to specific treatment in case of deprivation of liberty	Specific treatment in case of detention	Right to specific treatment in case of deprivation of liberty
		-1. Member States shall ensure that arrests of children are carried out on the basis of procedures and with safeguards appropriate to the child's age and degree of maturity. (AM 58)
		-1a. Member States shall further ensure that once arrested the child has the right to meet the holder of the parental responsibility or another appropriate adult as referred to in Article 5(1) promptly and in any event prior to questioning. (AM 59)
1. Member States shall ensure that children are detained separately from adults, unless it is considered in the child's best interest not to do so. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, Member States shall provide the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into	1. Member States shall ensure that children who are detained at any stage of the proceedings before the final determination by a court of the question whether the child concerned has committed the offence, are held separately from adults, unless it is considered in the	1. Member States shall ensure that children are detained separately from adults and may, when they reach the age of 18 years, continue to be detained separately from adults unless it is considered to be in their best interests or in the best interests of other detained children

account the individual circumstances of the detained person.	child's best interest not to do so.	not to do so. (AM 60)
	1a. When a detained child reaches the age of 18 years, Member States shall endeavour to provide the possibility to continue the separate detention where warranted, taking into account the individual circumstances of the detained person.	
	1b. Without prejudice to paragraph 1, children may be detained with young adults unless these persons are not suited for joint accommodation with children.	
<ul><li>2. Member States shall, during the period of deprivation of liberty, take all appropriate measures to:</li><li>(a) ensure and preserve the health and physical development of the child,</li><li>(b) ensure the right to education and training of the child,</li></ul>	<ul> <li>2. When children are detained in accordance with paragraph 1,</li> <li>Member States shall take all appropriate measures to:</li> <li>(a) ensure and preserve the health and physical development of the child,</li> <li>(b) ensure the right to education and</li> </ul>	2. Member States shall, during the period of deprivation of liberty, take all appropriate measures to:  (a) ensure and preserve the health, physical <i>and mental</i> development of the child, (AM 61)  (aa) protect the dignity and identity
(c) ensure effective and regular exercise of the right to family life including the maintenance of family ties,	training of the child,  (c) ensure effective and regular exercise of the right to family life,  (d) foster the <b>child's</b> future integration	<ul><li>of the child, (AM 62)</li><li>(b) ensure the right to education and training of the child,</li><li>(c) ensure effective and regular</li></ul>

(d) foster the development of the child and its future integration into society.	The measures taken shall be proportionate and appropriate to the period of detention.	exercise of the right to family life including the maintenance of family ties,  (d) ensure access to programmes that foster the development of the child and his or her future integration into society, (AM 63)  (da) ensure that the special requirements of those children with physical, sensory, and learning disabilities are provided for, (AM 64)  (db) ensure that all other rights of the child are protected, (AM 65)  (dc) ensure the freedom of the child to manifest his or her religion or belief. (AM 66)
		2a. Member States shall ensure that effective means of complaint and remedies are available to detained children, their lawyers and holders of parental responsibility or other appropriate adults. Member States shall also ensure that independent inspections are carried out on a periodic basic to check the state of detention facilities and the

	treatment of detainees, and shall take appropriate action on the findings. (AM 67)
--	--

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Timely and diligent treatment of cases	Timely and diligent treatment of cases	Timely and diligent treatment of cases
1. Member States shall ensure that criminal proceedings involving children are treated as a matter of urgency and with due diligence.	Member States shall <b>take appropriate measures to</b> ensure that criminal proceedings involving children are treated as a matter of urgency and with due diligence	1. Member States shall ensure that criminal proceedings involving children are treated as a matter of urgency and with due diligenc
2. Member States shall ensure that children are treated in a manner appropriate to their age, their special needs, their maturity and level of understanding, and bearing in mind any communication difficulties they may have.		2. Member States shall ensure that children are treated in a manner appropriate to their age, their special needs, their maturity and level of understanding, and bearing in mind any communication difficulties they may have.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to protection of privacy	Protection of privacy	Right to protection of privacy
1. Member States shall ensure that criminal proceedings involving children take place in the absence of the public, unless, after due consideration of the best interest of the child, exceptional circumstances justify a derogation.	1. Member States shall ensure that the privacy of children during criminal proceedings is protected.	1. Member States shall ensure that criminal proceedings involving children take place in the absence of the public, unless <i>in exceptional circumstances</i> the best <i>interests</i> of the child justify a derogation. (AM 68)
2. Member States shall ensure that the competent authorities take appropriate measures in criminal proceedings to protect the privacy of the child and family members, including their names and images. Member States shall ensure that the competent authorities do not publicly disseminate information that could lead to the identification of the child.	2. To that end, the Member States shall take appropriate measures, such as protecting the personal characteristics of the child that are taken into account and derive from the individual assessment referred to in Article 7, protecting the records referred to in Article 9(1) and 9(2) and avoiding that any inappropriate use of these records is made, and protecting the images of the child and its family members.	2. Member States shall ensure that the competent authorities take appropriate measures in criminal proceedings to protect the privacy and wellbeing of the child and family members, including their names and images. Member States shall ensure that the competent authorities and non-state actors, such as the media, do not publicly disseminate information that could lead to the identification of the child. (AM 69)
3. Member States shall ensure that the records referred to in Article 9(1) are not publicly disseminated.	3. This Article shall not prevent the competent authorities from publicly disseminating information	3. Member States shall ensure that the records referred to in Article 9(1) are not publicly disseminated.

that can lead to the identification of a child when this is strictly necessary in the interest of the criminal proceedings.	
---	--

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right of access to court hearings of the holder of parental responsibility	Right of the child to be accompanied by an adult during the court hearings	Right of access to court hearings of the holder of parental responsibility
Member States shall ensure that the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult as referred to in Article 5 have access to the court hearings involving the child.	1. Member States shall ensure that children have the right to be accompanied by a holder of parental responsibility during court hearings in which they are involved.	Except in cases where this would not be in the best interests of the child, Member States shall ensure that the holder of parental responsibility or another appropriate adult as referred to in Article 5 have access to the court hearings involving the child and may, where appropriate, be present during other stages in the proceedings at which the child is present. (AM 70)
	<ul> <li>2. In the situations where</li> <li>(a) it is not possible for a holder of parental responsibility to accompany the child during a court hearing in which the child is involved;</li> <li>(b) no holder of parental responsibility is willing to accompany the child;</li> <li>(c) it would be contrary to the</li> </ul>	

best interests of the child to be accompanied by a holder of parental responsibility; or

(d) the presence of a holder of parental responsibility could prejudice the criminal proceedings,

the child has the right to be accompanied by another appropriate adult acceptable to the court.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right of children to appear in person at the trial aiming at assessing the question of their guilt	Right of children to appear in person at the trial aiming at assessing the question of their guilt	Right of children to appear in person at, and take part in, the trial aiming at assessing the question of their guilt (AM 71)
1. Member States shall ensure that children are present at the trial.	1. Member States shall ensure that children have the right to be present at the trial aiming at assessing the question of their guilt. Member States shall take appropriate measures to promote that children are present at their trial.	1. Member States shall ensure that children are entitled to be present and to participate in the trial and shall take all necessary steps to enable them to participate fully, including by giving them the opportunity to be heard and to express their views. (AM 72)
2. Member States shall ensure that where children were not present at the trial resulting in a decision on their guilt, they shall have the right to a procedure in which they have the right to participate and which allows a fresh determination of the merits of the case, including examination of new evidence, and which may lead to the original decision to be reversed.	2. Member States shall determine in their national law the conditions under which children, who were not present at their trial, have the right to a new trial or another legal remedy at which they can be present and which allows a fresh determination of the merits of the case, including examination of new evidence, and which may lead to the original decision to be reversed.	2. Member States shall ensure that where children were not present at the trial resulting in a decision on their guilt, they shall have the right to a <i>retrial</i> in which they have the right to participate and which allows a fresh determination of the merits of the case, including examination of new evidence, and which may lead to the original decision to be reversed. ( <i>AM 73</i> )

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
European Arrest Warrant proceedings	European Arrest Warrant proceedings	European Arrest Warrant proceedings
1. Member States shall ensure that a requested child has the rights referred to in Articles 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15 and 18 in the executing Member State upon arrest pursuant to European arrest warrant proceedings.	Member States shall ensure that the rights <b>and entitlements</b> referred to in Articles 4, 5, 6a, 8, 12(1), 13 and 14 shall apply <i>mutatis mutandis</i> in respect of a requested child upon his arrest pursuant to European arrest warrant proceedings in the executing Member State.	1. Member States shall ensure that a requested child has the rights referred to in Articles 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15 and 18 in the executing Member State upon arrest pursuant to European arrest warrant proceedings.
2. Without prejudice to Article 12 of the Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA, the executing authorities shall take all measures to limit the duration of the deprivation of liberty of children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings.		2. Without prejudice to Article 12 of the Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA, the executing authorities shall take all measures to limit the duration of the deprivation of liberty of children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Right to legal aid	Right to legal aid	Right to legal aid
Member States shall ensure that national law in relation to legal aid guarantees the effective exercise of the right to access to a lawyer as referred to in Article 6.	This Directive is without prejudice to national law in relation to legal aid, which shall apply in accordance with the Charter and the ECHR.	Member States shall ensure that national law in relation to legal aid guarantees the effective exercise of the right to <i>be assisted by</i> a lawyer as referred to in Article 6. (AM 74)

Article 18a		
Remedies		
	Member States shall ensure that suspected or accused children in criminal proceedings, as well as children subject to European arrest warrant proceedings, have an effective remedy under national law in the event of a breach of the rights under this Directive. (AM 75)	

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Training	Training	Training
1. Member States shall ensure that judicial and law enforcement authorities and prison staff who deal with cases involving children are professionals specialising in the field of criminal proceedings involving children. They shall receive particular training with regard to children's legal rights, appropriate interviewing techniques, child psychology, communication in a language adapted to the child and pedagogical skills.	1. Member States shall ensure that law enforcement authorities and staff of detention facilities who deal with cases involving children receive adequate training to a level appropriate to their contact with children with regard to children's legal rights, appropriate interviewing techniques, child psychology, communication in a language adapted to the child and pedagogical skills.	1. Member States shall ensure that judicial and law enforcement authorities and prison staff who deal with cases involving children are professionals specialising in the field of criminal proceedings involving children. They shall receive particular training with regard to children's legal rights, appropriate interviewing techniques, child psychology, communication in a language adapted to the child and pedagogical skills, as well as on rules of confidentiality. (AM 76)
	1a. Without prejudice to judicial independence and differences in the organisation of the judiciary across the Union, Member States shall request that those responsible for the training of judges and prosecutors involved in criminal proceedings make available the training referred to in paragraph 1.	
2. Member States shall ensure that	2. With due respect for the	2. Member States shall ensure

lawyers defending children also receive such training.	independence of the legal profession, Member States shall recommend that those responsible for the training of lawyers make available both general and specialist training to increase the awareness of lawyers of the needs of children.	that lawyers defending children also receive such training.
3. Through their public services or by funding child support organisations, Member States shall encourage initiatives enabling those providing children with support and restorative justice services to receive adequate training to a level appropriate to their contact with children and observe professional standards to ensure such services are provided in an impartial, respectful and professional manner.	3. Through their public services or by funding child support organisations, Member States shall encourage initiatives enabling those providing children with support and restorative justice services to receive adequate training to a level appropriate to their contact with children and observe professional standards to ensure such services are provided in an impartial, respectful and professional manner.	3. Through their public services or by funding child support organisations, Member States shall encourage initiatives enabling those providing children with support and restorative justice services to receive adequate training to a level appropriate to their contact with children and observe professional standards to ensure such services are provided in an impartial, respectful and professional manner.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
		Non-discrimination
		1. Member States shall respect and ensure the rights set forth in this Directive as regards any child within their jurisdiction without discrimination of any kind, and irrespective of the child's or his or her parent's or legal guardian's race, colour, sex, sexual orientation, language, religion, political or other opinion, nationality, ethnic or social origin, property, disability, birth or other status.
		2. Member States shall promote training of all professionals involved in the administration of juvenile justice, specifically in the light of particularly vulnerable groups of children, such as street children, children belonging to racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities, migrant children, indigenous children, girls, children with disabilities and children who are repeatedly in conflict with the

	law, who may be victims of a lack of consistent policy and de facto discrimination. Their effective access to justice shall be ensured. (AM 77)
--	---

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Data collection	Data collection	Data collection
1. Member States shall, by [] and every three years thereafter, send to the Commission data showing how the rights set out in this Directive have been implemented.	Member States shall by [two years after the date mentioned in Article 23.1] and every three years thereafter, send to the Commission available data showing how the rights set out in this Directive have been implemented.	1. Member States shall, by [] and every three years thereafter, send to the Commission data showing how the rights set out in this Directive have been implemented.
2. Such data shall include in particular the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audiovisually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.		2. Such data shall include in particular the number of children given access to a lawyer, the number of individual assessments carried out, the number of interviews audiovisually recorded and the number of children deprived of liberty.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Costs	Costs	Costs
Member States shall meet the costs resulting from the application of Articles 7, 8 and 9 irrespective of the outcome of the proceedings.	1. Member States shall meet the costs resulting from the application of Articles 7, 8 and 9 irrespective of the outcome of the proceedings, unless these costs are covered in any other way.	Member States shall meet the costs resulting from the application of Articles 7, 8 and 9 irrespective of the outcome of the proceedings.
	2. Without prejudice to the right of access to justice, Member States may provide that a court may order to reimburse the costs mentioned in paragraph 1 if the following two conditions are complied with:  (a) the child has been convicted; and  (b) the reimbursement of the costs will not jeopardise the child's	

Commission proposal	Council general approach	Draft amendments LIBE
(ST 17633/13)	(ST 10065/14)	(DS 1098/15)

Non-regression clause	Non-regression clause	Non-regression clause
Nothing in this Directive shall be construed as limiting or derogating from any of the rights and procedural safeguards that are ensured under the Charter, the ECHR, or other relevant provisions of international law, in particular the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, or the law of any Member State which provides a higher level of protection.	Nothing in this Directive shall be construed as limiting or derogating from any of the rights and procedural safeguards that are ensured under the Charter, the ECHR, or other relevant provisions of international law, in particular the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, or the law of any Member State which provides a higher level of protection.	Nothing in this Directive shall be construed as limiting or derogating from any of the rights and procedural safeguards that are ensured under the Charter, the ECHR, or other relevant provisions of international law, in particular the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, or the law of any Member State which provides a higher level of protection.

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Transposition	Transposition	Transposition
1. Member States shall bring into force the laws, regulations and administrative provisions necessary to comply with this Directive by [24 months after its publication]. They shall immediately inform the Commission thereof.	1. Member States shall bring into force the laws, regulations and administrative provisions necessary to comply with this Directive by [36 months after its publication]. They shall immediately inform the Commission thereof.	1. Member States shall bring into force the laws, regulations and administrative provisions necessary to comply with this Directive by [24 months after its publication]. They shall immediately inform the Commission thereof.
2. When Member States adopt these measures, they shall contain a reference to this Directive or shall be accompanied by such a reference on the occasion of their official publication. The methods of making such a reference shall be laid down by the Member States.	2. When Member States adopt these measures, they shall contain a reference to this Directive or shall be accompanied by such a reference on the occasion of their official publication. The methods of making such a reference shall be laid down by the Member States.	2. When Member States adopt these measures, they shall contain a reference to this Directive or shall be accompanied by such a reference on the occasion of their official publication. The methods of making such a reference shall be laid down by the Member States.
3. Member States shall communicate to the Commission the text of the measures of national law which they adopt in the field covered by this Directive.	3. Member States shall communicate to the Commission the text of the measures of national law which they adopt in the field covered by this Directive.	3. Member States shall communicate to the Commission the text of the measures of national law which they adopt in the field covered by this Directive.
Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)

Entry into force	Entry into force	Entry into force
This Directive shall enter into force on the twentieth day following that of its publication in the <i>Official Journal of the European Union</i> .	This Directive shall enter into force on the twentieth day following that of its publication in the <i>Official Journal of the European Union</i> .	This Directive shall enter into force on the twentieth day following that of its publication in the <i>Official Journal of the European Union</i> .

Commission proposal (ST 17633/13)	Council general approach (ST 10065/14)	Draft amendments LIBE (DS 1098/15)
Addresses	Addresses	Addresses
This Directive is addressed to the Member States in accordance with the Treaties.	This Directive is addressed to the Member States in accordance with the Treaties.	This Directive is addressed to the Member States in accordance with the Treaties.

\_\_\_\_